

Exhibit 15 to Reply
Memorandum by All Plaintiffs
in Support of Alternative
Motion for Clarification
(Dec. 6, 2006)

Case No. 98-2651-CIV-Dimitrouleas/Seltzer

Dec. 5, 2006 Letter from Plaintiffs'
Counsel to EchoStar and NPS

WILMERHALE

Thomas P. Olson

+1 202 663 6651 (t)

+1 202 663 6363 (f)

thomas.olson@wilmerhale.com

December 5, 2006

BY EMAIL/PDF AND U.S. MAIL

Cynthia Ricketts, Esq.
Squire, Sanders & Dempsey LLP
40 North Central Avenue
Suite 2700
Phoenix, AZ 85004

Re: *CBS Broadcasting Inc. et al. v. EchoStar Communications Corp., et al.*, Case No. 98-2651-CIV (S.D. Fla.)

Dear Cindy:

I am writing to ask EchoStar to advise us whether EchoStar provided National Programming Service LLC, either directly or through Decisionmark, with a list of EchoStar subscribers, identifying information about EchoStar subscribers (such as telephone numbers), or an analysis of the eligibility of EchoStar subscribers.

Although we have asked the Court to order formal discovery on that issue, we may be able to avoid the need for at least some discovery if we can learn the facts informally.

I would appreciate hearing back from you by mid-day Wednesday with your response. Thanks.

Very truly yours,



Thomas P. Olson

WILMERHALE

Thomas P. Olson

+1 202 663 6651 (t)

+1 202 663 6363 (f)

thomas.olson@wilmerhale.com

December 5, 2006

BY EMAIL/PDF AND U.S. MAIL

Howard S. Goldfarb, Esq.
Homer Bonner
1200 Four Seasons Tower
1441 Brickell Avenue
Miami, FL 33131
Counsel for National Programming Service LLC and Michael Mountford

Re: *CBS Broadcasting Inc. et al. v. EchoStar Communications Corp., et al.*, Case No. 98-2651-CIV (S.D. Fla.)

Dear Howard:

I am writing to ask NPS to advise us whether it received -- either directly from EchoStar or from Decisionmark -- a list of EchoStar subscribers, identifying information about EchoStar subscribers (such as telephone numbers), or an analysis of the eligibility of EchoStar subscribers.

Although we have asked the Court to order formal discovery on that issue, we may be able to avoid the need for at least some discovery if we can learn the facts informally.

I would appreciate hearing back from you by mid-day Wednesday with your response. Thanks.

Very truly yours,



Thomas P. Olson